



County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir
Caerdydd
CF10 4UW
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

PAPURAU ATODOL

Pwyllgor PWYLLGOR CRAFFU AMGYLCHEDDOL

Dyddiad ac amser y cyfarfod DYDD LLUN, 17 CHWEFROR 2020, 2.30 PM

Lleoliad YSTAFELL BWYLLGOR 4 - NEUADD Y SIR

Aelodaeth Cynghorydd Patel (Cadeirydd)
YCynghorwyr Derbyshire, Owen Jones, Lancaster, Jackie Parry,
Parkhill, Owen, Wong a/ac Wood

9 Gohebiaeth yn dilyn y cyfarfod pwyllgor (*Tudalenau 3 - 16*)

Davina Fiore

Cyfarwyddwr Llywodraethu a Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol

Dyddiadd: Dydd Mawrth, 11 Chwefror 2020

Cyswllt: Graham Porter, 02920 873401, g.porter@caerdydd.gov.uk

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

Ref: RDB/RP/CW/17.02.2020

18 February 2020

Councillor Chris Weaver,
Cabinet Member for Finance, Modernisation & Performance,
Room 519,
County Hall,
Atlantic Wharf,
Cardiff CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Weaver,

Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 17 February 2020

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you, Councillor Wild, Councillor Michael and the officers for attending the Committee meeting on Monday 17 February 2020. As you are aware the meeting received items titled 'Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21 – Corporate Overview' and 'Draft Corporate Plan 2020 to 2023 & 2020/21 Draft Budget Proposals'.

The meeting initially considered the Corporate Overview and was followed by scrutiny of the draft budget proposals and sections of the draft corporate plan relevant to the terms of reference of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee. Presentations were made by officers from the Resources, Planning, Transport & Environment and People & Communities Directorates. Following the presentations Members had the opportunity to question the relevant Cabinet portfolio holders and supporting officers. The comments and observations made by Members following this item are set out in this letter.

Corporate Overview

- **Climate Change & Brexit** - During the meeting Members expressed concern on the potential financial risks presented by climate change and Brexit. Given recent developments they felt that the risks were very real and potentially very expensive to address, therefore, I would be grateful if you could confirm the scope and scale of the Council's planning and preparation for dealing with the potential impacts of both climate change

and Brexit, particularly where the Council believes that the greatest threats exist to provision of front line services.

- **Capital Borrowing Concerns** - During the meeting Members asked how sustainable the Council's proposed Capital Programme was over the next five years, and questioned the impact that this might have upon the wider revenue budget. The five year capital programme contains £938,875 million in proposals; much of which needs to be repaid by funds from the Council's revenue budget. An officer explained to the Committee that the current proposals had been assessed during the budget setting process, and that they were deemed both deliverable and affordable. Given the wider uncertainty and risk facing the United Kingdom economy, I would be grateful if you could provide the Committee with assurance that the current capital budget is affordable.

Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals

2020/21

- **Staffing for Transport Projects** – A Member expressed concern that the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate was reducing staff numbers at a time when the number of schemes coming through was increasing (particularly transport related). He was told that most of the capital funds for the new transport schemes would include provision for the temporary recruitment of staff to help deliver the projects. He and the Committee were satisfied by this answer, however, they would like assurance that:
 - The Council will be able to recruit the required number of staff, with the appropriate skills, and within the necessary timescale to deliver the new transport schemes;
 - The Council will be able to employ suitably qualified staff on short term contracts to deliver the work, rather than have to rely on expensive consultants.

- **Capital Line 37** – Line 37 allocates £5.678m towards transportation and environmental improvements, bus corridors and electric charging points. It does not provide any details on how the five year capital allocation will be split, for example, by geographical area or scheme type. Please confirm how this money will be split, including how it is allocated between the headline areas, i.e. transportation and environmental improvements, bus corridors and electric charging points.
- **Cycle Parking Provision** – At the meeting a Member questioned why some of the cycle parking provision in the city centre was so poorly located, and asked what could be done to identify better sites in future. As an example he referred to separate cycle parking facilities adjacent to Marks & Spencer and close to Miller & Carter – both in the city centre. I would be grateful if you could:
 - Confirm the current process that is used to identify suitable cycle parking facilities in Cardiff;
 - Provide details of any consultation that might take place prior to deciding on where to locate cycle parking – Committee Members believe that the Council should identify a mechanism to consult with ‘everyday cyclists’ instead of relying on responses from established cycling groups.
- **Vehicle Clamping** – At the meeting I asked if the Council’s new vehicle clamping scheme had actually started. I was told that it had commenced, however, the service was in the early stages of development and was focusing on the removal of problem vehicles. I would be grateful if you could provide the Committee with a short update on the new vehicle clamping contract, to include the number of vehicles clamped / towed away; the income generated; the resources currently employed by the Council in this area; agreed contacts with third parties to deliver the service and details on how the service plans to develop in the next twelve months.

- **Western Transport Bus Interchange** – The capital programme allocates a £1.4 million investment in 2020/21 and 2021/22 for the development and completion of the Western Transport Interchange. I would be grateful if you could provide the Committee with a completion date for this new transport scheme.
- **Capital Allocation – Cardiff City Transport Services Limited (Cardiff Bus)** – Capital line 59 allocates £13.6million for Cardiff Bus across the financial years of 2020/21 and 2021/22. The budget line explains that the funding will be '*subject to a further report to and decision of Full Council, due diligence and other matters*', with the ultimate aim of providing '*a package of support for Cardiff City Transport Services Limited*'. The Committee is concerned by the amount of capital allocated to support Cardiff Bus over two years, and ask that you provide the Committee with regular updates as developments unfold.
- **Moving Traffic & Attended Parking Enforcement Cameras** – Line 93 of the capital programme allocates £475,000 towards the installation of 'moving traffic cameras' and 'attended parking enforcement cameras' on new routes in the city centre. The Committee welcome the introduction of these cameras in the city centre, particularly if they are used to target problem and illegal parking, for example, blocking of bus lanes. I would be grateful if you could let the Committee know which routes these new cameras will target, which offences they will prioritise and when they will be introduced.

Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Portfolio - Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21

- ❖ **Delivered by the Planning, Transport & Environment Directorate**
- **Flooding** – At the meeting reference was made to the flooding that took place over the weekend and the impact that this had on local residents and the Council. Comments were also made about the growing threat of climate change, and the potential implications that this could have upon

coastal and river flooding. I would be grateful if you could explain to the Committee what the Council is currently doing to mitigate all types of flood risk, the resources being allocated and any long term forward thinking that is taking place.

❖ **Delivered by the People & Communities Directorate**

- **New Household Waste Recycling Centre in North Cardiff** – Line 39 of the capital programme allocates £3.325 million across the financial years 2020/21, 2021/22 and 2022/23 for the provision of a new Household Waste Recycling Centre in North Cardiff. At the meeting it was explained to Members that creating such a site in the north of the city was still a political commitment, however, the practicality of identifying a suitable site remained a challenge. The Committee was told that work would continue to identify a suitable site, and that capital funding had been committed to the scheme. I would be grateful if you could provide the Committee with a progress update on identifying a suitable scheme, to include details of sites that have been considered along with a realistic timescale for delivering the new facility.
- **Love Where You Live** – Members welcome the additional £60,000 that was included in the budget to help with the delivery of the revamped ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign. They feel that the scheme is an excellent educational / awareness raising tool that encourages volunteer participation and, therefore, provides excellent value for money. The wider budget allocates £4.446 million of new monies for dealing with the collection, removal and processing of waste; this is a huge amount of money when compared to the resources put towards the ‘Love Where You Live’ campaign. Improving how we manage waste and achieve cleaner streets is not just down to how we process, collect and remove waste, it also involves raising awareness and better public education. With this in mind the Committee ask that you:
 - Provide details of what the £60,000 for ‘Love Where You Live’ will provide, for example, staff, equipment, promotional budget, etc..;

- Increase the funding for 'Love Where You Live' as the scheme sends out a very positive message and engages with lots of volunteers providing excellent value for money.

I would be grateful if you would consider the above comments and work with the relevant Cabinet portfolio holders to provide a response to the content of this letter.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ramesh Patel".

Councillor Ramesh Patel
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc:

- Councillor Huw Thomas, Leader, Cardiff Council;
- Councillor Caro Wild, Cabinet Member Strategic Planning & Transport;
- Councillor Michael Michael, Cabinet Member Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment;
- Chris Lee, Corporate Director Resources;
- Ian Allwood, Head of Finance;
- Andrew Gregory, Director of Planning, Transport & Environment;
- Sarah McGill, Corporate Director People & Communities;
- Matt Wakelam, Assistant Director Street Scene;
- Davina Fiore, Director of Governance & Legal Services;
- Gary Jones, Head of Democratic Services;
- Members of Cardiff's Environmental Scrutiny Committee.

Cyf/My Ref:CM43107
Eich Cyf/Your Ref:: RDB/RP/CW/17.02.2020

Dyddiad/Date: 20 February 2020

Councillor Ramesh Patel
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee
City of Cardiff Council
County Hall
Cardiff
CF10 4UW

Dear Ramesh

Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 17 February 2020

Thank you for your letter dated 18 February 2020 and the useful comments raised. I can assure you that Cabinet was able to reflect on the points raised prior to our meeting on 20 February 2020.

May I firstly thank you as a Committee Chair for your participation in the recent Performance Panel, where the Steps, KPIs and Targets included in the Corporate Plan 2020/23 were considered in some detail. I believe this process has helped strengthen the Corporate Plan as well as our wider planning arrangements. A response to the issues raised has been shared with the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee following their consideration of the Corporate Plan.

I've set out below my response to the issues raised.

Climate Change

The Capital Programme includes examples of initiatives that are helping to tackle climate change. Examples include LED lighting, energy efficient housing, electric vehicles and their associated charging points.

A number of these schemes are funded by specific grant and others are supported from the Civil Parking Enforcement Reserve. Where funded by borrowing, capital-financing implications are reflected within the Council's Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP).

As part of the 2020/21 Revenue budget, funding has been made available to develop an Integrated Water Management Strategy and for a Food Co-ordinator to take forward aspects of the Cardiff Food Strategy.



Future investment in climate change initiatives will be considered as part of updating the Capital Programme and MTFP, and we will continue to seek to maximise all available funding streams.

Brexit

Despite Britain leaving the EU on 31st January 2020, there is still uncertainty regarding the impact on the economy and public finances due to the lack of clarity regarding the future relationship with the EU and any future trade deals negotiated as part of the transition phase.

This uncertainty is logged as a risk on the Council's Corporate Risk Register and the Council will continue to monitor implications and take action where necessary.

Capital Borrowing Concerns

It is important to note that the Capital Programme includes both General Fund and Housing Revenue Account (HRA) capital expenditure and both are expanding given new schemes being planned and the delivery of existing commitments, for example, the Council's target to build a significant number of new affordable housing units. As noted at the Committee, there are risks in terms of additional borrowing and these are set out in the Capital Strategy and Risk appendix included in the Cabinet budget papers. In proposing the draft programme, affordability is a key consideration and has included reference to the modelling impact of existing and future capital financing costs on the MTFP, having regard to the impact on Council Tax and Housing rent payers and the impact is monitored through the suite of Prudential indicators set by the Council.

The Council's S151 officer is required by the Prudential Code to confirm the affordability of the Capital Strategy. This is confirmed in the financial implications of the budget report.

Strategic Planning & Transport Portfolio – Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21

Staffing for Transport Projects

In respect of resource availability to deliver major projects set out in the Transport White Paper, we are fully aware of requirements and will be ensuring this is managed effectively.

As part of this, we are engaging closely with colleagues in Human Resources in order to identify the most effective way to ensure these posts are filled and that any use of consultants is minimised.

Capital Line 37

I set out in 'Appendix A' a breakdown of the £5.678m allocated to transportation and environmental improvements.

Cycle Parking Provision

Acknowledging the current and fragmented nature of City Centre cycle parking, we have commissioned a short study to map both existing and future demand and align this with UK best practice.

This assessment will report shortly and will identify future major cycle parking locations. This document will also be the basis of future consultation with Ward Councillors in order to optimise the approach and establish an agreed way forward.

Vehicle Clamping

Currently the Vehicle Clamping Team are working on behalf of the DVLA clamping and removing Untaxed and SORN vehicles off the road.

Initially, existing staff from the Civil Parking Enforcement Team were being used which has resulted in less patrols on the street. As of the beginning of February we have employed two members of agency staff, on a temporary basis, and if the service proves to be viable after a 6 month period then we would look to fill at least 2 permanent full time posts. There is also an administration officer and a supervisor, though these posts are not solely for the purpose of clamping.

Our Third Party contracts used to carry out this service includes the DVLA (whom we act on behalf of), Celtic Recovery who remove, store and scrap the vehicles, and South Wales Police who we use to confirm vehicles are not stolen or of Police interest.

Our current figures from April 2019 up until the end of January 2020 are as follows:

Total vehicles clamped: 354

Total vehicles lifted where clamp fee not paid: 118

Cost recovery is through clamp release payments, vehicle scrappage (10% of value) and auctioning of vehicles (50% of value)

Between April 2019 and January 2020:

- £100 release fees: 152 totalling £15,200.00
- £260 release fees: 42 totalling £10,920.00; 29 of which had the £160 surety fee refunded and so leaving a total of £6,280.00
- 114 vehicles have gone on to be scrapped amounting to a total income of £1,368.00
- 7 vehicles have been auctioned amounting to a total income of £1,504.55
- Total income generated in 10 months is £24,352.55

In 2020/21, we are looking to expand clamping and lifting to include persistent evaders (vehicles with multiple unpaid parking and moving traffic offence fines). This service would reduce the amount of unpaid fines and deter people from parking in restricted zones / using pay & display bays without payment. This will free up parking areas for paying customers and keeping the roads safe in Cardiff. The

service is also looking at how it can assess and remove dangerously parked vehicles more effectively.

Western Transport Bus Interchange

The planning application for the transport and development aspects of the scheme is likely to be submitted in July 2020. Discussions are currently taking place with Network Rail regarding the site remediation works to the rail embankment. Development is likely to be completed within 18 months from when the scheme commences on site.

Capital Allocation – Cardiff City Transport Services Limited (Cardiff Bus)

I am happy to provide regular updates to the Committee as developments unfold.

Moving Traffic & Attended Parking Enforcement Cameras

The attended cameras are proposed to target hot spot areas in the city centre and schools where the main issues occur. We anticipate the attended cameras will help change people's behaviour irrespective of whether an officer is in attendance.

The proposed locations are:

1. Wood Street junction with St Marys Street - (the bus lane outside O'Neil's) – vehicles in the bus lanes
2. Duke Street / Kingsway – vehicles in the bus lanes and on the crossing zig-zags
3. Mill Lane – a major bus route in the city centre and loading area
4. New George Street – vehicles parking on pavements and on the no loading restrictions.

We will then be using the rest of the attended cameras to rotate around schools to enforce the school zig-zags.

The unattended cameras proposed will be implemented in the city centre to cover banned turns for safety at junctions due to traffic signal changes and support the bus gate at the bottom of Westgate Street and the new bus lane on Castle Street.

Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment Portfolio – Draft Budget Proposals 2020/21

Flooding

Cardiff Council has clear and significant responsibilities in relation to managing sources of flooding from surface water, watercourses (non-main river) and groundwater. However, we also manage risks associated from the other sources, for example, the Coastal Protection Programme where we are leading on improvements to protect Cardiff from coastal flooding as we are the land owner. The table below summarises responsibility for each element:

Responsibility for sources of flooding

Source	Regulatory Body
Main River	Natural Resources Wales
The Sea	Natural Resources Wales
Reservoirs	Natural Resources Wales
Surface Water	Lead Local Flood Authority
Ordinary watercourse (i.e. non main river)	Lead Local Flood Authority
Groundwater	Lead Local Flood Authority
Public Sewers	Dwr Cymru Welsh Water

The Management of Risk

The decision to implement flood alleviation schemes is predominantly based on historic flooding events and Cardiff Council have proposed a number of schemes to Welsh Government's Flood Alleviation funding Pipeline. As part of the pipeline arrangements, Welsh Government provide 75% match funding for the production of business cases and construction. This provision from Welsh Government's Flood Branch is most welcome. The Flood Branch have also implemented small scale funding, where 85% of the construction costs are offered for flood interventions that require a rapid response. These small scale schemes benefit from a less formal business case and are based on historic flood events for schemes up to £100k.

The Rhiwbina Flood Defence Scheme is an example of this partnership funding that helped protect in excess of 200 homes from flooding. Cardiff did not see the intensity of rainfall impact in recent days that the South Wales Valleys were subject to and whilst some localised flooding events occurred, these were managed and appropriate support to homeowners and businesses was provided.

It is the intention of the Flood Risk Management Team to continue to be as proactive as possible in terms of flood defence work although this is subject to an ongoing consideration of priorities and availability of financial resources.

New Household Waste Recycling Centre in North Cardiff

There is a Capital Ambition objective to deliver a new Recycling Centre in North Cardiff. A review of the two operational Recycling Centres in Cardiff show they have capacity to support further growth of the City and a business case will be developed to demonstrate when a new Recycling Centre is required, allowing 3 years for the

development of the new Recycling Centre. This approach will ensure the Council meets the long-term need of the City in a sustainable manner.

To date, 8 sites have been reviewed in terms of a desk top exercise and I am sure that Committee will understand that the detail of this exercise is commercially sensitive.

Love Where You Live

The proposed allocation of funding specifically for this initiative is summarised below:

Community Development Coordinator	£35,000
Resources: Litter Picking equipment, promotional literature, planters	£25,000
TOTAL	£60,000

In addition to the above, the service area is looking at how it can support 'Love Where You Live' through the wider volunteer groups attached to People and Communities. This should provide improvements to the support of initiatives across the City without the need for significant additional funding in future years.

I hope that this letter capture all the points raised in your letter and thank you again for your support in the budget process.

Yours sincerely,



**Y Cyngorydd/Councillor Christopher Weaver
Aelod Cabinet dros Gyllid, Moderneiddio a Pherfformiad/Cabinet member for
Finance, Modernisation & Performance**

cc Councillor Huw Thomas, Leader, Cardiff Council;
Councillor Caro Wild, Cabinet Member Strategic Planning & Transport;
Councillor Michael Michael, Cabinet Member Clean Streets, Recycling & Environment;
Chris Lee, Corporate Director Resources;
Ian Allwood, Head of Finance;
Andrew Gregory, Director of Planning, Transport & Environment;
Sarah McGill, Corporate Director People & Communities;
Matt Wakelam, Assistant Director Street Scene;
Davina Fiore, Director of Governance & Legal Services;
Gary Jones, Head of Democratic Services;

Appendix A

Transport & Environmental Improvements Proposed Projects	2020/21 £	2021/22 £	2022/23 £	2023/24 £	2024/25 £
Bus Corridors (matchfunding for strategic corridors e.g. A470/ A4119 re WG grant bids)	335,000	307,500	85,000	0	0
Capital Projects (City Rd/ Canals/ Healthy Streets)	250,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000
Electric Vehicle Match funding - residential charging points	50,000	50,000	50,000	50,000	50,000
Electric Vehicle - Expansion	200,000	200,000	25,000	25,000	0
Total	835,000	1,557,500	1,160,000	1,075,000	1,050,000
					5,677,500

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol